

## Dilemmas of Immigration

PSCI 243-001

Spring 2020

Room 111, Annenberg (ANNS)  
Tuesday and Thursday 3:00-4:30pm

Professor Michael Jones-Correa  
Department of Political Science  
Room 438, PCPE

Email: [mjcorrea@sas.upenn.edu](mailto:mjcorrea@sas.upenn.edu)

Office: 438 Ronald O. Perelman Center for Political Science and Economics  
Office hours: Wednesday 2-4pm, Tuesday and Thursday 4:30pm-5pm, and by appointment.

\*\*

Behind the daily headlines about refugees refused entry, families separated, and undocumented migrants deported there is a set of hard questions which deserve closer attention: Should countries have borders? If countries have borders, how should they decide who is kept out and who is allowed in? How many immigrants is 'enough'? Are all immigrants equally desirable? What kinds of obligations do immigrants have to the society that receives them? What kinds of obligations do host societies have to immigrants? Should there be 'pathways' to citizenship for all residents? Can citizenship be earned? Should citizenship be automatic? This course explores a whole range of normative issues/dilemmas raised by immigration.

## Course Policies

### *Expectations*

This course will be in a loose lecture/discussion format. For this to work, *everyone has to participate*, so you are expected to attend class and actively contribute to class discussion. Each class meeting will involve both lecture and discussion. To help spark discussion you will be asked to write up a set of questions and reflections on the readings for the week, posted on the course website on Canvas (<https://canvas.upenn.edu/courses/1494173>). Your thoughts and questions will provide the framework for that week's discussion.

### *Laptop and Cell Phone Policy*

No cell phones may be used during class. This is an issue of respect for yourself, and your fellow students, so please turn them off during class time. There is a good deal of evidence<sup>1</sup> that laptops distract from learning and discussion. Think hard about bringing them to class.

### *Course Announcements*

The syllabus, miscellaneous course materials (including assignments) will be available at the course website on Canvas. Please be sure you have a functional Penn email account that you check regularly: you'll receive communications via Canvas or email.

### *Reading Assignments*

This is technically a lecture course but it is run through discussion and questioning of the readings, and the themes they raise. You are expected to read the readings before lecture. By "read" I mean have read them carefully, thought about them, taken notes on them. I will send out questions beforehand designed to help you think about the texts, and you should think about these in relation to the readings before we meet for class. Remember that these readings are not like textbooks; they will probably take you longer than usual to read, and you may need to re-read sections, so plan accordingly.

The readings are available on Canvas (go to <https://canvas.upenn.edu> and login with your PennKey and password).

---

<sup>1</sup> Pam Mueller and Daniel Oppenheimer, 2014, "The Pen Is Mightier than the Keyboard: Advantages of Longhand over Laptop Note Taking," *Psychological Science* 25(6): 1159-1168.

Susan Payne Carter, Kyle Greenberg, and Michael Walker. 2016. "The Impact of Computer Usage on Academic Performance: Evidence from a Randomized Trial at the United States Military Academy," SEII Working Paper #2016.02, MIT. And see: <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/11/22/business/laptops-not-during-lecture-or-meeting.html>)

Immigration is in the news almost every day—follow a national or international newspaper (the *New York Times*, the *Financial Times*, etc.) on a daily basis to keep up with events. We will refer to these in class frequently. Keeping up with the news will help!

### *Written Assignments*

Students will write two papers for this course. The first is a shorter (5-7pp) picking up on our discussion of borders and drawing on the class readings. The final paper will be a longer (10-15pp) paper on a topic of your choice, addressing a topic related to the course. Your papers should have a research question/hypothesis with the expectation that you will conduct substantial outside research beyond the course readings.

Papers should be typed and follow an accepted footnote and bibliographic style. Take care as you write—cite *all* your sources from whom you draw ideas/quotations. The typical style in political science is (Last Name, Year of Publication: Page), e.g. (Jones-Correa, 1998: 118), or if not referencing a specific page: (Jones-Correa, 1998). Footnotes and endnotes are also acceptable ways of acknowledging work. You can use any citation style you prefer as long as it is an official style (e.g. MLA or Chicago) and it is consistently used in your written work. Each report or paper should include a bibliography of works cited.

Suggested page length does not include title page and bibliography. Papers will be due electronically by **midnight** of the date specified.

### *Late Papers and Grading*

Anyone who anticipates a scheduling conflict should contact your TA or professor in advance. Except in extraordinary circumstances, no extensions will be granted within 48 hours of a deadline. Only after written confirmation from me that you can either turn in an assignment late should you consider the extension granted.

Late assignments will be penalized one third of a grade (e.g. A- to B+) for every day. If an extension is sought due to overlapping deadlines, please request an extension from the other relevant professor as well. No more than one extension will be granted in a term without a formal request by the student's Dean.

### *Honor Code*

For all assignments, students are required to abide by the University of Pennsylvania's Code of Academic Integrity. A copy of the code can be found at the following URL: <https://provost.upenn.edu/policies/pennbook/2013/02/13/code-of-academic-integrity>

Violations of the Code of Academic Integrity, especially plagiarism, may result in a failing grade in the course. If you have any questions about what might constitute plagiarism, do not hesitate to ask me. Students may also wish to read and complete the exercises on "Recognizing and Avoiding

Plagiarism” at <http://plagiarism.arts.cornell.edu/tutorial/index.cfm>

### *Accommodations*

Academic accommodations will be granted only to those who provide certification from the Weingarten Learning Resource Center

[http://www.vpul.upenn.edu/lrc/sds/academic\\_accommodations](http://www.vpul.upenn.edu/lrc/sds/academic_accommodations)

If you have any questions or concerns regarding course policies or other matters, just ask!

## Requirements and Grading

### Class Participation (20%)

- All class participants are expected to attend and actively contribute to each class session.
- You should post two short responses each week on Canvas: 1) your reaction to the readings posted on the course Canvas website is due each week by midnight Monday. These posts can be questions, things that particularly struck you while reading, or something you disagreed with. 2) a response to your classmates' responses. These can respond/build on classmates' comments or start a new thread themselves. These can be posted anytime during the week.

### Writing Assignments (40%)

- 5-7 page paper due February 7<sup>th</sup> (15%)
  - Short paper building on class readings and discussion on Borders.
- 10-15 page paper due May 8<sup>th</sup> (25%)
  - The topic must touch on course themes but otherwise is flexible. Make an appointment to see the instructor no later than mid-way through the course to talk about your paper topic.

### Exams (40%)

- Exam 1 (March 5) (20%)
- Exam 2 (April 28 online) (20%)

## Dilemmas of Immigration

### Why immigration? (January 16)

- Douglas Massey. 1999. "Why Does Immigration Occur? A Theoretical Synthesis." Pp. 34-52 in *The Handbook of International Migration: The American Experience*, edited by C. Hirschman, P. Kasinitz and J. DeWind. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Douglas Massey et al. *Worlds in Motion: Understanding International Migration at the End of the Millennium*, pp. 1–59 (chapters 1 and 2). New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1999 (CW)
- Douglas Massey and Pren 2012. "Unintended consequences of US immigration policy: explaining the post 1965 surge from Latin America" in *Population and Development Review* 38

## Borders

### Why borders? (Week of January 21 and 23)

- Michael Walzer. 1983. "Membership," Chapter 2 in *Spheres of Justice: A Defense of Pluralism and Equality*.
- Joseph Carens. 1987. "Aliens and Citizens: The Case for Open Borders." *The Review of Politics*. 49(2): 251-273.
- Seyla Benhabib. 1999. "Citizens, Residents and Aliens in a Changing World: Political Membership in the Global Era." *Social Research*. 66:3 pp. 709-744.
- David Abraham. 2010. "Doing Justice on Two Fronts: The Liberal Dilemma in Immigration." *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 33:6 pp. 968-285.

#### *Recommended*

- David Miller 2016. "Open Borders," Chapter 3 in *Strangers in Our Midst: The Political Philosophy of Immigration*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. Pp. 38-56.

### What do we want borders to do? (Week of January 28 and 30)

- Peter Andreas. 2003. "Re-Drawing the Line: Borders and Security in the Twenty-first Century." *International Security* 29:2 pp. 78-111.
- John Torpey. 1998. "Coming and Going: On the State Monopolization of the Legitimate 'Means of Movement.'" *Sociological Theory*. 16:3 pp. 239-259.
- David Androff and Kyoko Y. Tavassoli. 2012. "Deaths in the Desert: The Human Rights Crisis on the U.S. Mexico Border." *Social Work*. 57:2 pp. 165-173.
- "US Border Crossings are Fewer, Riskier and More Expensive." *Wall Street Journal*. October 4, 2017.

- Sarah Murphy. "Life and Death on the Mediterranean." *AJ+ On the News*. June 20, 2017 <https://medium.com/aj-news/life-and-death-on-the-mediterranean-a6885d1349c0>
- ACLU, The Constitution in the 100-Mile Border Zone. <https://www.aclu.org/other/constitution-100-mile-border-zone>

### Who should be let in? (Week of February 4 and 6)

- Jens Hainmueller and Daniel Hopkins. 2015. "The Hidden American Immigration Consensus: A Conjoint Analysis of Attitudes toward Immigrants." *American Journal of Political Science*. 59:3 pp. 529-548.
- Migration Policy Institute. 2003. "Family Reunification."
- American Immigration Council. 2013. "The Advantages of Family-Based Immigration."
- Massimiliano Tani. 2014. "Using a Point System for Selecting Immigrants." *IZA World of Labor*.
- Making Sense. 2017. "Would the US Benefit from a Points-Based System?"

### Who should be kept out? (Week of February 11 and 13)

- John Higham. 1955. *Strangers in the Land*. Ch. 1 and 2.
- Douglas Baynton. Baynton, *Defectives in the Land: Disability and Immigration in the Age of Eugenics*, University of Chicago Press, 2016. "Defect: A Selective Reinterpretation of American Immigration History." Ch. 2
- European Stability Initiative. 2015. "The Merkel Plan."
- Full Video & Transcript: President Donald Trump Rally in Harrisburg, Pennsylvania. Saturday, April 29, 2017. PA Farm Show Complex and Expo Center
- Leaf van Boven and Paul Slovic. "The Psychological Trick Behind Trump's Misleading Terror Statistics." January 28, 2018. *Politico*. <https://www.politico.com/magazine/story/2018/01/28/trump-administration-terror-statistics-216541>

### Is there an obligation to take in (at least some) migrants? (Week of February 18 and 20)

- United Nations. 1951/1968. *Convention and Protocol Related to the Status of Refugees*.
- Maria Cristina Garcia. 2017. *The Refugee Challenge in Post-Cold War America*. Chapter 4.
- Jacqueline Bhabha. 2003. "More Than Their Share of Sorrows: International Migration Law and the Rights of Children." *22 St. Louis University Public Law Review* 253.
- Talia Inlander. 2009. "Status Quo or Sixth Ground? Adjudicating Gender Asylum Claims." In Seyla Benhabib and Judith Resnik eds. *Migrations and Mobilities: Citizenship, Borders and Gender*. New York University Press.

## Illegal Immigration and the Rights of Non-Citizens: How should countries respond to people who enter illegally? (Week of February 25 and February 27)

- Roberto Gonzales. *Lives in Limbo*. Chapter 1.
- Kristen Hill Maher. 2002. "Who Has The Right To Rights?" in Alison Brysk ed. ` University of California Press.
- Nando Sigona. 2012. "I have too much baggage': the impacts of legal status on the social worlds of irregular migrants." *Social Anthropology/Anthropologie Sociale* 20:1 pp. 50–65.
- Joseph Carens. 2009. "The Case for Amnesty." *Boston Review*. New Democracy Forum on Immigration." <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty-joseph-carens>
- Responses to Carens. 2009. *Boston Review*.
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/legalization-costs-outweigh-benefits-alexander-aleinikoff>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/historically-america-both-legalized-and-deported-migrants>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/moral-argument-details-matter-peter-schuck>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/if-moral-duties-apply-domestic-noncitizens-they-apply-all-noncitizens-arash-abizadeh>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/apply-compassion-offered-illegal-immigrants-most-vulnerable-citizens-carol-swain>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/moral-argument-belongs-center-immigration-debate-gara-lamarche>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/only-addressing-realities-north-american-economic-integration-douglas-massey>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/amnesty-should-be-matter-regret-not-bonus-gerald-neuman>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/mismatch-between-moral-intuitions-political-views-rainer-baubock>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/keep-families-together-mary-lyndon-shanley>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/basic-rights-short-term-immigrants-also-need-protection-linda-bosniak>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/more-conservative-proposal-has-better-chance-succeeding>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/we-might-have-choose-between-competing-evils-eamonn-callan>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/sheer-length-stay-not-itself-decisive-jean-bethke-elshtain>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/earned-legalization-more-just-penalty-free-amnesty-marc-rosenblum>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/compromised-rights-are-never-acceptable-roberto-suro>
  - <https://bostonreview.net/forum/case-amnesty/joseph-h-carens-responds>



## Citizenship

### Citizenship and Semi-Citizenship: should democracies have partial memberships? (Week of March 3 and March 5)

- Elizabeth Cohen. "The Moral Meaning of Temporary Immigration Statuses in US Citizenship Law."
- Nancy F. Cott. 1998. Marriage and Women's Citizenship in the United States, 1830-1934. *American Historical Review*. 03:4 pp. 1440-1474.
- Christian Joppke. 2011. "Immigration, Citizenship and the Need for Integration," in Rogers Smith ed. *Citizenship, Borders, and Human Needs*.
- Nicole Prchal Svajlenka, Angie Bautista-Chavez, and Laura Muñoz Lopez 2017. "Temporary Protected Status." Center for American Progress.  
<https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2017/10/20/440400/tps-holders-are-integral-members-of-the-u-s-economy-and-society/>

### **\*\* Spring Break (Week of March 9) \*\***

### Should citizenship be automatic? (Week of March 24 and 26)

- Rogers Brubaker. 1998. *Citizenship and Nationhood in France and Germany*. Preface and Ch. 1.
- Ayelet Schachar. 2009. *The Birthright Lottery*. Harvard University Press. "Citizenship as Property." Selections. <http://www.hup.harvard.edu/catalog.php?isbn=9780674032712>
- Rogers Smith. 2009. "Birthright Citizenship and the Fourteenth Amendment in 1868 and 2008." *Journal of Constitutional Law*. 11:5.
- Bonnie Honig. *Democracy and the Foreigner*. Ch. 4 "The Foreigner as Citizen."

### Should citizenship be earned? Can it be bought? (Week of March 31 and April 2)

- Alex Horton. 2017. "U.S. Army kills contracts for hundreds of immigrant recruits. Some face deportation." [https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/checkpoint/wp/2017/09/15/army-kills-contracts-for-hundreds-of-immigrant-recruits-sources-say-some-face-deportation/?tid=ss\\_mail&utm\\_term=.8171e40c9d61](https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/checkpoint/wp/2017/09/15/army-kills-contracts-for-hundreds-of-immigrant-recruits-sources-say-some-face-deportation/?tid=ss_mail&utm_term=.8171e40c9d61)
- Ronald Krebs. 2006. *Fighting for Rights: Military Service and the Politics of Citizenship*. Cornell University Press. Ch. 1.
- Janelle Wong. 2007. "Who Fights? Substitution, Commutation and 'Green Card Troops.'" *DuBois Review* 4:1 pp. 167-188.
- Matthew Valencia. 2017. "Citizens of anywhere: Globalisation has turned citizenship into a commodity." <https://www.1843magazine.com/features/citizens-of-anywhere>

- Owen Parker. 2016. "Commercializing Citizenship in Crisis EU: The Case of Immigrant Investor Programmes." *Journal of Common Market Studies*. 55: 2 pp. 332- 348.
- Ana Tanasoca. 2016. "Citizenship for Sale: Neomidieval, Not Just Neoliberal?" *European Journal of Sociology*. 57:1 pp. 169-195.

**Do we become citizens by acting as citizens? Is citizenship about practicing citizenship or a set of accomplishments? (Week of April 7 and April 9)**

- Christopher Zepeda-Milián. 2016. "Weapons of The (Not So) Weak." *Critical Sociology* 42:2 pp. 269-287.
- Takeyuki Tsuda. 2012. "Whatever Happened to Simultaneity? Transnational Migration Theory and Dual Engagement in Sending and Receiving Countries." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*. 38:4 pp. 631-649.
- James McCann and Michael Jones-Correa. *Holding Fact and Standing Firm?* 2020. (manuscript excerpts)

**Assimilation**

**Who can be/is [one of us]? (Week of April 14 and April 16)**

- Michael Walzer. 1990. "What Does It Mean To Be An 'American'?" *Social Research* 57:3
- Sarah Song. 2009. "What Does It Mean To Be An American?" *Daedalus*. Spring. Pp. 31-40.
- Bart Bonikowski and Paul DiMaggio. 2016. "Varieties of American Popular Nationalism." *American Sociological Review*. 81:5 pp. 949-980.
- Thierry Devos and Mahzarin Benaji. 2005. "American = White?" *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 88:3 pp. 447-46
- Deborah Schildkraut. 2007. "Defining American Identity in the Twenty-First Century: How Much "There" is There?" *Journal of Politics*. 69:3 pp. 597-615.

**Does immigrant integration require change? From whom? (Week of April 21 and 23)**

- Ruben Rumbaut. 2013. "Assimilation's Bumpy Road." In Merlin Chowkwanyun and Randa Serhan eds. *American Democracy and the Pursuit of Equality*. Pp. 194-219.
- Richard Alba and Victor Nee. "Assimilation Theory for a New Era of Immigration." *International Migration Review*. 31:4 pp. 826-874.
- Sarah Song. 2005. "Majority Norms, Multiculturalism, and Gender Equality." *American Political Science Review*. 99:4 pp. 473-489.
- Aristide Zolberg and Long Witt Woon. 1999. "Why Islam Is Like Spanish." *Politics and Society*. 27:1 pp. 5-38.
- Suzette Brooks-Masters. *Change is Hard*. 2020.

- Michael Jones-Correa. 2011. *All Immigration is Local*. Center for American Progress.

Loose ends/Wrapping Up (April 28)